

## MANAGER'S RECRUITMENT GUIDANCE

### STAGE 2 – SHORTLISTING

This toolkit has been designed to provide hiring managers with an overview of the tools and resources available that will assist them in carrying out a recruitment exercise.

A Shortlisting Checklist is available to download from the HR Hub as an aide memoire and to assist Hiring Managers at the shortlisting stage.

### Table of Contents

<b>1. SHORTLISTING RESPONSIBILITIES .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>2. SELECTION PANEL COMPOSITION.....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>3. SHORTLISTING APPROACHES .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>LIMITED POOL.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>PRE-SHORTLISTING CONSIDERATIONS .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>4. DISABILITY DISCRIMINATION AND REASONABLE ADJUSTMENTS.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>5. MARKING SCHEMES AND WHICH TO USE FOR SHORTLISTING .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>BASIC MARKING SCHEME.....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>POINTS-BASED MARKING SCHEME.....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>6. SHORTLISTING GUIDANCE.....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>QUALIFICATION EQUIVALENTS .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>APPLYING DESIRABLE CRITERIA .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>7. RECORDING SHORTLISTING OUTCOMES .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>8. SHORTLISTING DECISION &amp; PRE-INTERVIEW.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>ACTIONING DECISION.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>RECORDS RETENTION .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>PRE-INTERVIEW .....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>GAPS IN EMPLOYMENT AND SUITABILITY TO WORK WITH CHILDREN.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>SHORTLISTING FEEDBACK .....</b>	<b>9</b>

## KEY ROLES AND DEFINITIONS

<b>Hiring Manager</b>	<p>The Hiring Manager is the person responsible for creating the Staff Requisition and completing the recruitment activities to fill the vacancy.</p> <p>For EA Corporate recruitment, it is anticipated that the Hiring Manager will be the Line Manager or Service Manager.</p> <p>For Schools, it is recognised that the duties of the Hiring Manager cut across those of the Chair of the Board of Governors (as Chair of the selection panel), and of the Principal (as Secretary to the selection panel).</p>
<b>HR Recruiter</b>	<p>On receipt of the Staff Requisition, the Hiring Manager will be assigned a HR Recruiter to oversee their recruitment exercise, and to advise and guide the Hiring Manager through the recruitment and selection process.</p>
<b>Chairperson</b>	<p>It is anticipated that in most cases the Hiring Manager will fulfil the role of Chair of the selection panel. For Schools, the Chair of the Board of Governors would act as Chair of the selection panel.</p>

### 1. SHORTLISTING RESPONSIBILITIES

It is the responsibility of the Hiring Manager/Chairperson to ensure that shortlisting is carried out in line with the following guidance.

The selection panel is responsible for shortlisting applicants to decide which applicants meet, or most strongly meet the essential criteria (and the desirable criteria, if it has been decided to apply these) as set out on the person specification. Applicants who meet these criteria, as demonstrated on their application form, will be shortlisted and taken forward to the next stage in the selection process.

### 2. SELECTION PANEL COMPOSITION

At the early planning stage the Hiring Manager will have confirmed the selection panel members, secured diary dates and planned for shortlisting. Panel composition and governance must be managed in line with the panel protocols for teaching and non-teaching appointments.

The protocols are set out in the following documents which are available to download from the recruitment information webpage

- Recruitment Framework for Non-Teaching Posts.
- Teaching Appointments Scheme for Controlled Schools.

The Hiring Manager is responsible for ensuring that only those who have received appropriate training are invited to participate on a selection panel.

Selection panel members must comply with the requirements set out in the above documents with regard to confidentiality, conflicts of interest, and canvassing.

### 3. SHORTLISTING APPROACHES

Following the closing date, the Hiring Manager should establish the number of applications received to determine whether or not there has been a sufficient response.

#### LIMITED POOL

Where too few applications have been received, the Hiring Manager should seek advice from the HR Recruiter with regard to potentially re-advertising. If the Hiring Manager decides to re-advertise a post, applicants should be notified accordingly. If no further applications are received following a second advertising, the selection panel should normally progress the recruitment exercise with the original applications.

#### PRE-SHORTLISTING CONSIDERATIONS

The Hiring Manager is responsible for ensuring that the shortlisting exercise is carried out in a way that is transparent, fair, objective and proportionate.

In advance of shortlisting, the Hiring Manager should agree the approach with the selection panel, including whether to use a basic, or points-based marking scheme to shortlist applications.

### 4. DISABILITY DISCRIMINATION AND REASONABLE ADJUSTMENTS

The Disability Discrimination Act requires employers to make reasonable adjustments in respect of applicants and employees who are disabled, with a view to ensuring that disabled people are not disadvantaged and are afforded equality of opportunity in employment. It should be noted that the duty of reasonable adjustment applies at all stages of the recruitment and selection process.

At shortlisting stage, the panel may become aware of the potential need for reasonable adjustments to be made to selection processes, and it is important to take these into consideration at an early stage to ensure appropriate arrangements can be made, e.g. providing assistance with completing application forms, or providing these in different formats.

The HR Recruiter will liaise with the Hiring Manager where a candidate has requested reasonable adjustments to be made.

## 5. MARKING SCHEMES AND WHICH TO USE FOR SHORTLISTING

### BASIC MARKING SCHEME

Rating	Description
<b>Not Met</b>  X	<b>Unsatisfactory</b>  No evidence is given or the evidence given is unsatisfactory or irrelevant. The information provided is not clear or well structured.
<b>Met</b>  ✓	<b>Satisfactory</b>  The evidence provided is satisfactory and meets most or all aspects of the criteria. The information provided is largely clear and well structured. Whilst there may be some areas which could be improved upon the evidence is satisfactory.

Using this Marking Scheme, panel members assess the evidence in applicants' responses and award a simple 'Met' or 'Not Met' for each criterion.

The advantage of the Basic Marking Scheme is its simplicity, which makes it relatively quicker to apply. The disadvantage is that it does not allow for panel members to make an assessment of the quality of evidence in responses, and therefore to differentiate between applicants. Applying the Basic Marking Scheme will simply provide two lists, and may result in a large number of applicants to be interviewed.

The Basic Marking Scheme is likely to be an appropriate choice where the selection criteria will be very clearly "met" or "not met" (e.g. qualifications, or length of experience). It is feasible to award a 'Met' or 'Not Met' to such clearly measurable criteria and then apply a Points-Based Marking Scheme to more qualitative criteria, where a judgement is required to assess the strength and quality of evidence in an applicant's response.

It may also be appropriate to choose the Basic Marking Scheme where the applicant pool is small.

## POINTS-BASED MARKING SCHEME

Rating	Description
1 to 3	<b>Does not meet expectations</b> No evidence is given or the evidence given is unsatisfactory or irrelevant. The information provided may not be clear or well structured. Whilst it may be 'adequate' in some areas overall it is below required level. There are sufficient weaknesses in the evidence to render the candidate's performance as not of the level required.
4 to 5	<b>Meets expectations</b> The evidence provided is satisfactory and meets most or all aspects of the criteria. The information provided is largely clear and well structured. The evidence leads to an effective performance that is more than simply 'adequate'.
6 to 7	<b>Strongly meets expectations</b> The evidence provided is good or strong and comfortably meets most or all aspects of the criteria. The information provided is clear and well structured. Evidence is comprehensive.

Using a Points-Based Marking Scheme, panel members are able to assess the quality of evidence in applicants' responses and award a score for each criterion.

The disadvantage of a points-based Marking Scheme is that it may take a little longer to apply, as panel members must assess the quality of responses and make an objective judgement as to the most appropriate score. However this is far outweighed by the fact that it enables the selection panel to differentiate between applicants, i.e. with higher quality evidence attracting higher scores. This approach allows the panel to manage the applicant pool to bring the strongest applicants forward to the next stage of the recruitment process.

When using a Points-Based Marking Scheme the panel will produce a merit list based on scores and may set a cut-off score (e.g. anchored to the mid band) to determine a manageable candidate pool to progress to the next stage in the process. Should the selection panel wish to set a cut-off score, the Hiring Manager may contact the HR Recruiter for advice.

Note that any scores awarded at the shortlisting stage do not normally carry forward to the interview assessment.

## 6. SHORTLISTING GUIDANCE

Only the information set out in the application form should be used for shortlisting. Job applicants should not submit any additional information with their application, unless this has been expressly requested as part of the recruitment process.

Selection panel members must not make assumptions, draw inferences, or introduce other knowledge that they might have about individuals, or of the context of any examples being given by applicants.

Shortlisting criteria should be applied as at the closing date for the advertised post, unless it has been clearly stated otherwise (this decision must have been made before the job was advertised, and cannot be introduced at a later stage).

The on-line application form is a structured questionnaire which provides defined fields and boxes for applicants to respond to each of the criteria, which were identified by the Hiring Manager on the Person Specification. Bear in mind that part-time experience is of equal value to experience gained full-time.

If an applicant fails to satisfy any of the essential shortlisting criteria, their application should not be progressed.

If the benefit of doubt is given to an applicant's response to a criterion, it should also be given to other applicants.

If it transpires that a mistake has been made in setting or advertising the selection criteria in the person specification, it may be necessary to cancel the recruitment exercise, correct the errors and re-advertise the post correctly. In such cases, the Hiring Manager should seek advice from the HR Recruiter.

Each panel member should in the first instance independently shortlist applications to help prevent bias. After independent shortlisting the Hiring Manager should collate views to agree the final shortlist and complete an agreed shortlisting record. Where individual panel views differ, it may be necessary for the Hiring Manager to convene a panel meeting to discuss and agree the final shortlist.

The selection panel should be able to demonstrate how their decisions are objectively based on the evidence in the application form and not, for example, on stereotypical or discriminatory assumptions. The justification for shortlisting decisions should be recorded by each panel member on an Individual Shortlisting Record for each applicant.

## QUALIFICATION EQUIVALENTS

Where clarification is required on educational equivalents, selection panel members can refer to the following source to determine whether qualifications are at the required level and equivalent to the criteria set out in the person specification:

Regulated Qualifications Framework (RQF)

<https://www.gov.uk/what-different-qualification-levels-mean/list-of-qualification-levels>

Quality Assurance Agency, “Qualifications Can Cross Boundaries”

[https://www.qaa.ac.uk/docs/qaa/quality-code/qualifications-can-cross-boundaries.pdf?sfvrsn=a852f981\\_12](https://www.qaa.ac.uk/docs/qaa/quality-code/qualifications-can-cross-boundaries.pdf?sfvrsn=a852f981_12)

If the selection panel are unable to clearly make a determination as to whether or not a qualification is at the required level, the Hiring Manager should contact the HR Recruiter for guidance.

## APPLYING DESIRABLE CRITERIA

Where desirable criteria have been set, the selection panel may choose whether or not these need to be applied to manage the candidate pool.

Applying a Points-Based Marking Scheme to the essential shortlisting criteria may be sufficient to enable the panel to objectively identify the strongest candidates to progress to the next stage in the selection process. Therefore the panel may decide it is unnecessary to apply the desirable criteria.

If the panel have determined through shortlisting that a large number of applicants meet the requirements of the essential shortlisting criteria, they may then decide to apply the desirable criteria. If multiple desirable criteria have been set, they must be applied in the priority order agreed at the planning and advertising stage. The panel may choose to apply one or more of the desirable criteria to manage the candidate pool.

## 7. RECORDING SHORTLISTING OUTCOMES

Two different template options are available to download from the recruitment information webpage for use by individual selection panel members to capture their shortlisting assessments. The level and complexity of the particular role are factors that panels should consider when deciding which shortlisting template is best suited to their recruitment competition. The Hiring Manager should ensure that panel members are clear on which shortlisting template they should use.

### Option 1: Panel Member Shortlisting Template

Using this option, each panel member will complete one template. The template captures the panel member’s shortlisting assessments for all candidates on a single form, and should detail summary comments on the reasons for their assessment. This template is likely to meet the needs for most recruitment exercises.

### Option 2: Candidate Shortlisting Record

Using this option, each panel member will complete an individual shortlisting record for each candidate. This Record allows for a more detailed narrative against each of the shortlisting criteria

and a points based marking scheme can be used to assess the quality of evidence in applicants' responses and award a score for each criterion. This is likely to meet the needs of more senior roles.

Whichever template is used, each selection panel member should complete their shortlisting assessments for all candidates, and email these to the Hiring Manager.

Following individual panel member shortlisting, the Hiring Manager should review panel members' submissions to determine the extent to which the assessments are aligned, and make arrangements with selection panel members to agree the final shortlist. Where panel member assessments are largely aligned, a virtual meeting may be an efficient way to bring panel members together to discuss their assessments and agree a final shortlist. On other occasions, a face-to-face or longer meeting of panel members may be necessary, e.g. where there is disagreement, or where there are a large number of candidate applications to discuss.

## 8. SHORTLISTING DECISION & PRE-INTERVIEW

The Hiring Manager is responsible for ensuring a record is completed of all final shortlisting decisions. The Shortlisting Final Order of Merit Template is provided for this purpose and it should include summary justification for the shortlisting outcome for each candidate.

The Hiring Manager should upload the following documents to the e-recruitment system, by attaching them to the Staff Requisition:

- The Shortlisting Final Order of Merit.
- The Interview Schedule Template with details of the interview schedule, location and any instructions/directions for candidates.
- Any presentation brief to be issued to candidates in advance of attending for interview. An Example Presentation Candidate Brief Template is available as a point of guidance.

All three documents are available to download from the recruitment information webpage.

It is important to remember that completed shortlisting documentation may later be required for feedback purposes, and, as discoverable records, may also be needed to respond to a Subject Access Request, or to defend a challenge to a recruitment decision.

### ACTIONING DECISION

Once the Hiring Manager has uploaded the shortlisting outcomes, the candidates need to be moved through the stages of the selection process on the e-recruitment system. For corporate posts the HR Recruiter will move candidates and issue them with a correspondence.

For school based posts the Hiring Manager or Hiring Manager's Assistant will need to move candidates through the stages of the selection process and issue out the relevant correspondence.

### RECORDS RETENTION

The Hiring Manager is responsible for securely retaining shortlisting documentation in line with the relevant records retention and disposal policy.



## PRE-INTERVIEW

In advance of the interview/next stage in the selection process, the panel should agree the following:

- Interview questions, in line with the criteria set out in the person specification.
- Expected question responses, e.g. key words/phrases ('model responses').
- Whether an additional task is to be completed by candidates such as a presentation, test or another type of exercise such as an observed lesson.

More guidance on these areas is included in the Manager's Recruitment Guidance - Stage 3 Interviewing.

## GAPS IN EMPLOYMENT AND SUITABILITY TO WORK WITH CHILDREN

For regulated appointments, the selection panel should review application forms for shortlisted candidates to determine whether there are any unexplained gaps in candidates' career history since leaving full time education. Any unexplained gaps should be followed up with candidates at the end of their interview.

## SHORTLISTING FEEDBACK

The Shortlisting Feedback Template can be used to provide feedback in a written format. Hiring Managers are encouraged to respond to requests electronically, wherever possible. This document is available to download from the recruitment information webpage.